CASE OFFICER'S REPORT

Application Reference:	PL/2024/00489
Application Type:	Householder planning permission
Site Inspection:	08 March 2024
Consultation ends:	08 April 2024
Case officer:	Helena Carney

Site Address:	Apple Tree Cottage, 210 Hollow Lane, Wilton, Marlborough, SN8 3SR
Proposal:	Construction of garage, shed and greenhouse and application of lime render to existing cottage
Recommendation:	Approve with Conditions

POLICIES

Wiltshire Core Strategy (adopted January 2015):
Core Policy 50: Biodiversity and Geodiversity
Core Policy 51: Landscaping
Core Policy 57: Ensuring High Quality Design & Place Shaping
Core Policy 58: Ensuring the Conservation of the Historic Environment
Core Policy 64: Demand Management

The Wiltshire Local Transport Plan 2011 – 2016: Car Parking Strategy (March 2011)

Wilton Conservation Area Statement, March 2005

The National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) 2023

Planning Practice Guidance (PPG)

Sections 16, 66 & 72 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990

ISSUES

- Impact upon the amenity of occupiers of neighbouring properties
- Scale, design and materials
- Impact upon the listed building and the character and appearance of the conservation area
- Impact upon highway safety and parking provision
- Impact upon ecology
- Impact upon the North Wessex Downs National Landscape

REPRESENTATIONS

Original Plans:

Grafton Parish Council: support

Wiltshire Council Conservation Officer: objection (full comments are available on the council's website)

Wiltshire Council Highways Officer: no objection

Third party representations: none received at time of writing

Additional Plans:
Grafton Parish Council: no comment received at time of writing

Wiltshire Council Conservation Officer: final comment - no objection (full comments are available on the council's website)

Third party representations: none received at time of writing

RELEVANT PLANNING HISTORY

• PL/2023/00627 - Extension and refurbishment of existing cottage, approved 15/06/2023
• PL/2023/00689 - Extension and refurbishment of existing cottage, approved 15/06/2023
• PL/2023/05477 - T1-5 Spruce trees. Fell. Trees have grown too big for the garden. Garden to be relandscaped and new trees planted to replace, no objection 03/08/2023
• PL/2023/07547 - Replacement of existing windows, approved 24/11/2023
• PL/2023/09938 - Discharge of conditions 3, 4, 6, 7 of planning application PL/2023/00689 (Extension and refurbishment of existing cottage), approved 09/02/2024
• PL/2023/10333 - Discharge Of Condition 5 relating to application PL/2023/00627: Extension and refurbishment of existing cottage, under consultation at time of writing

ASSESSMENT

The application site relates to Apple Tree Cottage, a Grade II listed property located within the Wilton Conservation Area. The property is a typical traditional vernacular cottage of the area, being built of brick, flint and chalk, with timber framed core, under a thatched roof. The application site benefits from a generous sized rear garden and detached outbuildings to the rear of the property.

The area is residential in character with neighbouring properties located to either side and to the rear and on the opposite side of the road.

The statutory listing description for the property is as follows:

GRAFTON HOLLOW LANE (west side), Wilton SU 26 SE 5/44 Apple Tree Cottage

GV II

Three cottages in row, now 1 house. Brick, but ley half brick laced flint raised in limestone. Thatched roof. Single-storey and attic, 6 bays. Boarded door in 3rd bay. Two and 3-light windows, some diamond leaded in wood frames. Thatch swept over 6 dormers both sides and hipped ley. 3 stacks. Interior not seen.

Listing NGR: SU2680861429

The application site lies within the North Wessex Downs National Landscape.

Proposals:
Planning permission and listed building consent has recently been granted for the construction of a single-storey rear extension and alterations to the cottage, which included the demolition of the existing outbuilding and garage to facilitate the construction of the new extension.

Planning permission is being sought for the construction of a garage, shed, greenhouse and application of lime render to the existing cottage; and listed building consent is being sought for the application of lime render to the existing cottage.

It was noticed during the application process that no elevation or floor plans were submitted with regard to the proposed shed and greenhouse, although they were clearly shown on the proposed site plan. This was brought to the attention of the agent and elevation and floor plans were provided for the shed and greenhouse. The agent also advised that the existing garage had been demolished and as such amended plans and a revised Design and Access Statement was provided to reflect this. With agreement from the agent, the proposal description for the householder and listed building consent applications were updated to remove reference to 'replacement of existing garage' as the garage has been demolished and the householder planning application was updated to include the erection of a shed and greenhouse. The amended and additional plans were subject to a re-consultation period for 14 days.

Impact upon amenity of occupiers of neighbouring properties:
The adopted Wiltshire Core Strategy CP 57 requires that development should ensure the impact on the amenities of existing occupants/neighbours is acceptable and ensure that appropriate levels of amenity are achievable within the development itself.

The proposed lime render will not impact upon the occupiers of neighbouring properties as it will result in a visual change to the cottage and does not involve any additional built form.

The proposed garage will be constructed in the same location as the previous garage but will occupy a slightly larger footprint and sit approximately 1.5m higher. The garage is located adjacent to the northern boundary next to a private access road leading to a couple of neighbouring properties. The nearest neighbouring property is Brook House, located at least 9m to the north of the garage on the opposite side of the access road. Therefore, whilst it is acknowledged that the garage will be slightly higher than previous and occupy a slightly larger footprint, given the single-storey nature of the proposals and the separation distance that exists, it is considered not to adversely impact upon the occupiers of neighbouring properties as a consequence of overbearing impact, overshadowing or loss of privacy.

The proposed shed and greenhouse will be sited in the rear garden of the application site. The shed will be sited in the south-western corner of the application site, at least 20m to the south of the nearest neighbouring property (Mallards Piece) and the greenhouse will be sited approximately 1m from the northern boundary of the application site, at least 15m from the nearest neighbouring properties (Lallands and Brook House) located on the opposite side of an access track.

Given the modest single-storey nature of the shed and greenhouse and the separation distances that exist between them and the nearest neighbouring properties, it is considered that there will be no adverse impact upon neighbour amenity as a consequence of overbearing impact, overshadowing or loss of privacy as a result of the proposals.

Scale, design and material:
The adopted Wiltshire Core Strategy CP 57 requires a high standard of design in any new developments including alterations or extensions to a dwelling. Development is to create a strong sense of place through drawing on local context and being complementary to the locality. The policy seeks for any new development to positively respond to the existing townscape and effectively integrate into its settings.

The proposals do not give rise to any concerns from a planning perspective. The proposed garage will be located in the same location as a previous garage that has been demolished. The garage will be constructed to an appropriate scale, design and of suitable materials and is considered to be an acceptable addition.

The proposed lime render is considered appropriate in this instance and does not give rise to any concerns from a planning perspective.

The proposed shed and greenhouse are modest buildings, constructed to a traditional design and of suitable materials and are considered acceptable additions.

The assessment therefore mainly relates to the impact upon the significance of the listed building and its setting and upon the character and appearance of the conservation area.

Impact upon the listed building and the character and appearance of the conservation area:
Section 16 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 states that in considering whether to grant listed building consent for any works the local planning authority [or the Secretary of State] shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.

Section 66 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 requires ‘special regard’ to be given to the desirability of preserving a listed building or its setting.

Section 72 of the Act further states that in the exercise of any functions, with respect to any buildings or other land in a conservation area, under or by virtue of any of the provisions mentioned in this Section, ‘special attention’ shall be paid to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of that area.

Apple Tree Cottage is a grade II listed building within the Wilton Conservation Area. Dating from the 18th century, the cottage was originally a row of three more humble dwellings, but at some point in the mid 20th century have been combined into one dwelling. Although a little tired, the building is a typical traditional vernacular cottage of the area, being built of brick, flint and chalk, with timber framed core, under a thatched roof.

Internally, the building has been 'modernised' with replaced floors with concrete, inappropriate plasterwork and it has lost two original staircases (both having been replaced and altered, with one having been relocated) although a third staircase is original and does survive. The first floor is oddly arranged, with mid-to-later 20th century partitions, doorways and subdivision of spaces – this has been done to try to amalgamate the three cottages into one space, with the structural limitations placed on it due to the timber frame construction.

The council's Conservation Officer was consulted on the proposals to consider the impact upon the listed building and its setting an upon the character and appearance of the conservation area and she provided the following comments:

"*Lime render – there are no objections to the replacement of the concrete 'apron' or plinth with lime render, however there are strong concerns over the total application of render to an existing exposed brick elevation. This is due to the visual change from original exposed brick to a rendered elevation and resulting aesthetic impact on the vernacular character of the cottage. Whilst some rendered elevations are in evidence within Wilton, this is in the minority, and traditional brick is the overriding vernacular material of traditional cottages within the conservation area. There is no evidence that this elevation was originally rendered, and considering the rest of the cottage is predominantly brick, the application of render is considered to cause visual harm to its overall appearance and aesthetics, the traditional vernacular materials being a key feature of the significance of this listed cottage. Whilst of course the practical reasons for apply the render are understood, it is possible that sensitive and targeted repair could address these issued. Therefore it is the overriding change in appearance that is considered to cause harm the significance of this designated heritage asset and fails to preserve its special interest, contrary to current policy (NPPF paragraph 208, as there are no public benefits to outweigh the harm to the significance of the designated heritage assets, and Wiltshire Council Core Policies 57 & 58).*

Garage – There are no objections to the demolition of the existing garage building, as it a 20th century structure constructed of concrete block and is of little significance. Whilst there are no objections to the principle of replacing the garage, such structures should take inspiration from existing traditional outbuildings and be designed with traditional features, in order to preserve the and setting of the listed building and the character and appearance of the conservation area. The use of modern 'roller shutter' garage door(s) does not preserve the setting of the building within the conservation area and therefore should be removed from the scheme. Open fronted 'cart shed' structures are more appropriate vernacular outbuildings. Traditional paired timber doors could be considered, but the proportions of the wider opening do not lend themselves to these. Therefore the doors should be omitted entirely from the scheme."

The above comment and request for amendments was brought to the attention of the agent and revised plans were submitted to address the Conservation Officer's concerns. In addition, the agent was requested to provide elevation and floor plans of the proposed shed and greenhouse as these were not included at submission.

In consideration of the revised plans and additional plans showing the shed and greenhouse, the council's Conservation Officer provided further comments as follows:

"*Amended plans have been received as follows:*
Lime render – the area of proposed lime render has now been reduced from the whole elevation to a traditional plinth, to carry on the plinth from the front elevation: this is an acceptable compromise that should hopefully provide protection from penetrating damp.

Garage – the doors have been revised to be two pairs of traditional side-hung doors, as per my suggestion in my initial comments.

The revisions address the concerns I raised previously, and there are no objections to the proposals (as revised).

Materials should be conditioned for the garage, as these do not appear to have been confirmed within the submitted information."

"Further plans have been received for this application that now detail the proposed shed and greenhouse, which were shown on the proposed plans, but elevations were not provided. There are no concerns over the erection of these two structures within the curtilage of the listed building or in the proposed locations, as they will not cause harm to the setting."

In consideration of the above comments and suggested conditions, it is concluded that the proposed development will not harm the significance of the listed building or its setting and will not harm the character and appearance of the conservation area.

Impact upon highway safety and parking provision:
The proposals involve the construction of a new garage, sited in the same location as the previous garage that has been demolished. The garage will provide 2 parking bays.

In consideration of the proposed development, the council's Highways Officer commented "*I refer to the above planning application for replacement of the existing garage and for the application of lime render to the existing cottage.*

The application of lime render does not have a highway impact.

As I pointed out in the previous application for the refurbishment of the cottage, the low brick retaining wall adjacent to the new entrance hall will inhibit easy access to the garage spaces and without the submission of a swept path analysis, I am unsure as to whether this will result in the garage being inaccessible, the applicant may want to check this if it is intended to park a vehicle in the garages. However the existing driveway is capable of accommodating 3 vehicles and therefore parking standards can be met.

The existing vehicle access is not proposed to be altered as part of this application.

I wish to raise no highway objection."

Notwithstanding the concern raised by the Highways Officer regarding access being inhibited by the low brick wall, the proposed development does not give rise to any highway safety concerns and as stated above, the application site is considered a sufficient size to accommodate the required number of off-street parking spaces for a property of this size.

Therefore the proposed development is considered acceptable.

Impact upon ecology:
The proposed development comprises application of lime render to the existing cottage, erection of a shed, greenhouse and garage.

The proposed garage will be constructed in the same location as the previous garage that has been demolished. It is recognized that the previous garage had low potential for species to be using the structure and it is acknowledged that this building no longer exists. As the garage is no longer in situ, no further ecological survey work is required to be undertaken in respect of this planning application.

Impact upon the North Wessex Downs National Landscape:
The proposed garage, shed and greenhouse will be read in the context of the host dwelling and surrounding properties and as there will be no encroachment into the open countryside, no harm will be caused to the special qualities of the North Wessex Downs National Landscape.

Conclusion:
The proposed application seems fitting with regards to scale, design and materials. The proposals are considered acceptable in the context of its surroundings and in accordance with the general criteria set out in the aforementioned policies of the local development plan.

Conditions: (3)

1 The development hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of three years from the date of this permission.

REASON: To comply with the provisions of Section 91 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 as amended by the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004.

2 The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved plans and documents:

Application Form
Design and Access Statement, Ref: 22-07 RS3, received 21/03/2024
A Historic Buildings Study. Report No. B8999 Sept/Oct 2022
Drawing No. 22-07-L01, Location Plan

Drawing No. 22-07-P30A, Proposed Site Plan, received 21/03/2024
Drawing No. 22-07-P31B, Ground Floor Plan - Proposed, received 21/03/2024
Drawing No. 22-07-P32A, Rear Elevations - Proposed, received 08/02/2024
Drawing No. 22-07-P33A, Front and Side Elevations - Proposed, received 08/02/2024
Drawing No. 22-07-P34A, Side Elevation (North) - Proposed, received 08/02/2024
Drawing No. 22-07-P35A, Section B - Proposed, received 08/02/2024
Drawing No. 22-07-P36, Shed and Greenhouse Plans and Elevations - Proposed, received 21/03/2024

REASON: For the avoidance of doubt and in the interests of proper planning.

3 No works above foundations or slab level shall commence until details of the timber cladding and clay roof tiles to be used in the construction of the garage hereby permitted, have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Details submitted shall include for each item of external material a photograph and the name and description, including colour or finish, as supplied by the manufacturer. The works shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

REASON: The application contained insufficient information to enable this matter to be considered prior to granting permission and the matter is required to be agreed with the Local Planning Authority in the interests of visual amenity and preserving the setting of the listed building and the character and appearance of the Conservation Area.