CASE OFFICER'S REPORT

Application Reference:	PL/2023/07298
Application Type:	Full planning permission
Site Inspection:	
Consultation ends:	23 November 2023
Case officer:	Lucy Rutter-Dowd

Site Address:	Toad Cottage, 10 Marlborough Road, Stibb Green, Burbage, Marlborough, Wilts, SN8 3AU
Proposal:	Installation of air source heat pump to heat Toad Cottage and alterations to existing oak framed building to provide living accommodation for elderly relative, with works to include erection of sunroom/ conservatory and 1. no existing car parking spaces within oak framed building to be converted to provide a kitchenette and shower/ toilet.
Recommendation:	Approve with Conditions

Proposal and Site Description

The site is located on the north side of Burbage, to the east of the A346. It contains a two storey thatched cottage with a single storey wing and a tiled roof. The property is located along the eastern boundary of the site and is the third bay of a larger thatched cottage which is grade II listed and lies within the Burbage Conservation Area. The site has a modern outbuilding (granted permission in 2017) located along the western boundary of the site containing two garage parking spaces and a home office/sunroom. The boundaries of the site are defined by hedges and fencing. The hedge is located along the front boundary of the site nearest the road with fencing around the remaining boundaries. The rear boundary is raised up with a terraced area leading up to the fields behind the site. The site is washed over by the North Wessex Downs National Landscape (NL).

This application initially sought permission for the erection of a single storey conservatory extension to the western elevation of the outbuilding and a porch to the front elevation. The proposed additions would be built in a similar style and materials and would enable use of the building as a granny annexe. The submission also seeks permission for the installation of an air source heat pump to the norther elevation of the listed host dwelling. All aspects of the proposal require full planning permission due to being within the grounds of a listed building, The air source heat pump also requires Listed Building Consent as such an associated application has been submitted. Revised plans have been received during the application process to address concerns raised by the conservation officer.

Policies

National Context:

National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) Planning

Practice Guidance (PPG)
Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990

Local Context:

Wiltshire Core Strategy (WCS) adopted 2015

- Core Policy 1 – Settlement Strategy
- Core Policy 2 – Delivery Strategy
- Core Policy 41 – Sustainable construction and low-carbon energy
- Core Policy 51 – Landscape
- Core Policy 57 - Ensuring high quality design and place shaping
- Core Policy 58 - Ensuring the conservation of the historic environment
- Core Policy 61 - Transport and Development

Constraints

- Conservation Area
- North Wessex Downs National Landscape (NL)
- Grade II Listed Building

Key Issues

- Principle of development
- Scale, design and materials.
- Impact on neighbour amenity.
- Parking / Highways.
- Impact on the landscape setting of the AONB
- Heritage Impacts

Relevant Planning History

17/00290/FUL - Removal of existing timber garage and shed and erection of new oak framed double garage with office/sunroom - Approved with conditions - 05/04/2017

Consultation Responses

Archaeology - No objections.

Highways - No objections.

Conservation - Objects. Comments included within report.

Representations

None received.

Planning Considerations and Assessment

Section 70(2) of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 and section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 require that the determination of planning applications must be made in accordance with the Development Plan, unless material considerations indicate otherwise.

Principle of Development:

The works relate to a well established residential property and as such are considered to be acceptable in principle.

Landscape Impacts:

CP51 of the WCS proposes that Development should protect, conserve and where possible enhance landscape character and must not have a harmful impact upon landscape character, while any negative impacts must be mitigated as far as possible through sensitive design and landscape measures.

The site lies within the North Wessex Downs National Landscape (NL). However, as the development remains within the built environment of the area, no harm will be caused to the landscape setting of the NL

Heritage Impacts:

The initial response from the conservation officer reads as follows:

Paragraph 194 requires that applicants describe the significance of any heritage assets affected, including any contribution made by their setting. This should include sufficient information to provide a clear understanding of the significance of the heritage asset and its setting and the potential impact of any proposals on that significance. In this case, whilst the applications are accompanied by a "Design & Access Statement" the document provides limited information about the building and fails to provide any objective assessment of the fabric affected, its date or significance or of the impact of the proposals on the setting and, as a result, it fails to meet the requirements of the NPPF.

However, paragraph 195 also provides for the local planning authority to make its own assessment of impact and the following heritage recommendations are offered on this basis.

Toad Cottage is a grade II listed building located within the Burbage Conservation Area. The building subject to this application is a modern garage building, which replaced a timber

outbuilding/garage, having been approved in 2017 based on revised plans after initial concerns were raised over the size and potential impact of the original proposals on the listed building's setting.

This application is almost identical to the pre-application enquiry carried out earlier this year, with a slightly smaller conservatory and a wider yet shallower porch. As such the preapplication guidance has largely been ignored.

Whilst there are no objections to the principle of converting part of this building to provide a form of ancillary accommodation, conservation concerns lie in the increase in size, which formed the main concern over the original 2017 proposals. In order to achieve the proposed extension, further excavation of the land would be required to lower the existing lawn area.

This would further impact on the listed building's setting, by encroachment of the outbuilding by extensions. The applicant was clearly advised that this would be unacceptable and that any accommodation should be contained within the footprint of the existing outbuilding.

In addition the applicant was also advised that there are conservation concerns that the building is also becoming too domestic in its external character and appearance (with the porch and conservatory addition). Instead it should retain is ancillary character as a subordinate building and not become overtly residential in character: this is to preserve the setting of the listed building and the relationship of the outbuilding with the main cottage.

As such at the current time the proposed ancillary accommodation is not supported in heritage terms.

Regarding the proposed air source heat pumps the proposed location is relatively discreet. However, no details have been provided to confirm what, if any, internal changes to the building are required in order to install the system i.e. new pipework, ventilation/condenser units, upgrading of existing radiators and/or insulation. As such details are requested.

Summary & conclusion: The NPPF confirms that when considering the impact of a proposed development on the significance of a designated heritage asset, great weight should be given to the asset's conservation (and the more important the asset, the greater the weight should be). It makes clear that any harm to a designated heritage asset requires clear and convincing justification.

As such further amendments and details are requested before this application can be fully assessed.

In response to the conservation officer concerns the applicant provided a revised plans which removed the external alterations and extensions to the outbuilding. The conservation officer welcomes the revisions to ensure the building retained its ancillary appearance. However, concerns remains in terms of the lack of information regarding any internal works required to accommodate the air source heart pump. The following comments were received:

'This application has now been amended removing the previously proposed conservatory and porch. As such the conversion would retain the ancillary character of the outbuilding/garage as a

subordinate building and would not become overtly residential in character. This would preserve the setting of the listed building and the relationship of the outbuilding with the main cottage.

Regarding the proposed air source heat pumps the proposed location is relatively discreet. However, no details have been provided to confirm what internal changes to the building are required in order to install the system i.e. new pipework, ventilation/condenser units, upgrading of existing radiators and/or insulation. As such details are requested.

Summary & conclusion: The NPPF confirms that when considering the impact of a proposed development on the significance of a designated heritage asset, great weight should be given to the asset's conservation (and the more important the asset, the greater the weight should be). It makes clear that any harm to a designated heritage asset requires clear and convincing justification.'

As such further details are required for the installation of the air source heating pump to the listed building before this application can be fully assessed.'

Whilst it is noted that the application fails to be supported by a heritage statement which addresses the significance of the building, the conservation officer also highlights that paragraph 195 allows the LPA to make its own assessment. In terms of the installation of the air source heat pump, the council is of the view that further details regarding the internal alterations proposed to accommodate the heat pump could be secured by way of condition which would allow the applicant to start works on the ancillary accommodation without any further hold ups and while discussions regarding the works to the LB continue. It is also considered that any issues arising from the situation would unlikely be insurmountable, as such, proposing a suitably worded condition would be the appropriate course of action in this instance. The required condition would be tied to the associated permission for listed building consent.

Design and Visual Impact:

Core Policy 57 of the Wiltshire Core Strategy states that "A high standard of design is required in all new developments, including extensions, alterations, and changes of use of existing buildings. Development is expected to create a strong sense of place through drawing on the local context and being complementary to the locality." Proposals should seek to enhance local distinctiveness and have regard to existing townscapes, patterns of development and the historic environment and landscape setting.

The revised scheme sees little change to the exterior of the buildings. The outbuilding will remain the same and the proposed air source heat pump will be positioned to the blind side of the building. No visual harms is therefore likely to occur form the development, and the character of the surrounding area will be preserved. No change of use is required in this instance, as such the building will remain as an ancillary structure to the host dwelling.

Neighbour Amenity:

The proposal would unlikely have an impact on neighbour amenity as there would be no over shadowing, loss of light or loss of privacy as a result of the works. One domestic air source heat pump is unlikely to cause a noise nuisance significant enough that would impact neighbour

amenity. However, sufficient detail needs to be supplied to enable the LPA to make that assessment e.g. noise emissions from it.

Highways Safety:

The following comments were received from the highway officer:

'Based on the information provided I am minded that the changes will not have a significant negative impact on the interests of the highway and as such I am happy to offer no highway objection.'

Conclusion:

In conclusion, the proposed application seems fitting with regard to scale, design, and materials. The proposal is considered acceptable in the context of its surroundings and is in accordance with the general criteria set out in the aforementioned policies of the local development plan.

Conditions: (3)

1 The development hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of three years from the date of this permission.

REASON: To comply with the provisions of Section 91 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 as amended by the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004.

2 The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved plans and documents:

Doc Title: Application Form.
Drg Title: Location Plan.
Doc Title: Air Source Heat Pump Technical Specifications. Produced by: Daikin.
Drg Title: Block Plan. Dated: 09/11/2023.
Drg Title: Existing Layout (Plans and Elevations). Dated: 23/08/2023.
Drg Title: Proposed Plans and Elevations. Dated: 02/11/2023.

REASON: For the avoidance of doubt and in the interests of proper planning.

3 The accommodation hereby permitted shall not be occupied at any time other than for purposes ancillary to the residential use of the main dwelling, known as Toad Cottage and it shall remain within the same planning unit as the main dwelling.

REASON: The additional accommodation is sited in a position where the Local Planning Authority, having regard to the reasonable standards of residential amenity, access, and planning policies pertaining to the area, would not permit a wholly separate dwelling.